

SIRIRAJ MEDICAL JOURNAL

Ms. No : **Date :**

Title :

.....

Author :

Comments for transmission to the author(s) :

(Please remember not to state your views on whether the paper should be published or not)

Contribution number : Author :

Title :

CONFIDENTIAL COMMENTS FOR THE EDITOR

Please grade each feature (where appropriate) from A – excellent to E – very poor

Scientific reliability

Novelty/originality	_____	Analysis of data	_____
Clinical importance	_____	Presentation/grammar/style	_____
Scientific importance	_____	(including illustrations, tables etc.)	_____

Abstract

Does the summary give an adequate
Picture of the paper overall? Y / N

Results

Are adequate numbers used? Y / N
Is the calculation method appropriate? Y / N
Are statistics necessary? Y / N

Introduction

Are the aims and objectives of the
paper set out succinctly? Y / N
Clearly? Y / N

Discussion and conclusions

Are the conclusions clearly stated? Y / N
Are they justified? Y / N
Are there any ethical issues to be
addressed? Y / N
Are the conclusions adequately discussed
against the background of current knowledge
and health issues? Y / N

Materials and methods

Are these clearly explained? Y / N
Are the methods easily understood? Y / N

Please use this space to write any confidential comments for the editor

Please give an overall score to the paper where:

- A – Excellent – must publish
- B – Good but needs minor correction
- C – Correctable deficits – probably publish
- D – Major faults – probably not credible? Reject
- E – Very poor – reject outright

Overall score _____

.....
Reviewer's signature

.....
Name

.....
Date

N.B. Do you want to re-check the manuscript after the author have rewritten?

Yes No